### **SYMPOSIUM**

# Advancing Trust in Science: Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity

Hosted by the Department of Medical Ethics & Health Policy and the Institute for Translational Medicine & Therapeutics, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine

## Date:

Thursday, October 10, 2024

#### Location:

Widener Lecture Hall University of Pennsylvania Museum 3260 South Street Philadelphia, PA 19104 (Or Zoom)

## **Description:**

Several high-profile examples of research misconduct, defined as fabrication, falsification, and plagiarism, have recently come to light, amidst a moment of already precarious and waning public trust in science. The issues are not new, although there are now novel tools for identifying misconduct, proliferating platforms for discussing allegations and publicizing concerns, and growing unease about politically motivated misconduct allegations. In addition, the US Department of Health and Human Services Office of Research Integrity recently proposed new regulations to revise the Public Health Service Policies on Research Misconduct, with a final rule expected this year. Against this churning backdrop, how should institutional stakeholders – including universities and publishers – address concerns about research misconduct, from prevention to response? How should institutions build and maintain a culture of scientific integrity? When problems arise, how should they ensure procedural protections for those accused of misconduct, protect accusers from retaliation, conduct comprehensive investigations, facilitate rapid resolution, and promote transparency? Should responses differ when institutional leaders are accused of misconduct or when misconduct arises outside the health sciences? This symposium, which will be published in an open access special issue of the Journal of Law, Medicine, and Ethics in Spring 2025, will present commentaries on these issues and others from leading experts in ethics and law, those with experience identifying research misconduct, and those sharing relevant stakeholder perspectives, including researchers, academic leadership, and journal editors and publishers.

# Agenda

| 8:00-8:30 | Breakfast  |
|-----------|--|
| 8:30-9:00 | Opening Remarks  |
|           | Holly Fernandez Lynch, JD, MBE Associate Professor of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine |
|           | Dawn Bonnell, PhD  |
|           | Vice Provost for Research, University of Pennsylvania  |
|           | Garret FitzGerald, MD, FRS   |
|           | Director, Institute for Translational Medicine and Therapeutics, University of   |
|           | Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine   |
| 9:00-9:45 | Panel 1: The Scientists - Misconduct Motivation, Detection, and Education  |

|             | Moderator: Steven Joffe, MD, MPH   |
|-------------|--|
|             | Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania        |
|             | Perelman School of Medicine  |
|             |  |
|             | Max Bazerman, PhD – An Insider's Perspective on How to Reduce Fraud in the Social        |
|             | Sciences   |
|             | Straus Professor of Business Administration, Harvard University                          |
|             |  |
|             | Paul S. Brookes, PhD – Misconduct detection - evolving methods and lessons learned       |
|             | from 15 years of scientific image sleuthing  |
|             | Professor, Anesthesiology, University of Rochester Medical Center                        |
|             |  |
|             | Kayte Spector-Bagdady, JD, MBE – Research Misconduct and Novel Governance                |
|             | Challenges of Data-Driven Research   |
|             | Associate Professor and Interim Co-Director, Center for Bioethics & Social Sciences,     |
|             | University of Michigan   |
| 9:45-10:15  | Panel 1 Discussion   |
| 10:15-10:30 | Break  |
|             |  |
| 10:30-11:30 | Panel 2: The Journals – Roles and Challenges   |
|             | Moderator: Matthew McCoy, PhD  |
|             | Assistant Professor of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania      |
|             | Perelman School of Medicine  |
|             |  |
|             | Ferric C. Fang, MD – Retractions of COVID-19-related Publications During and After the   |
|             | Pandemic   |
|             | Professor of Laboratory Medicine, Pathology and Microbiology, University of              |
|             | Washington School of Medicine  |
|             |  |
|             | Ruth O'Hara, PhD – Null Results Are Results  |
|             | Senior Associate Dean for Research, Stanford University School of Medicine               |
|             |  |
|             | Rita Redberg, MD, MS - Scientific Misconduct and Medical Journals                        |
|             | Professor of Medicine, University of California San Francisco; Immediate Past            |
|             | Editor-in-Chief, JAMA Internal Medicine  |
|             |  |
|             | Lisa Bero, PhD – Systematic reviewers have an obligation to promote research integrity   |
|             | Chief Scientist, Center for Bioethics and Humanities and Professor of Medicine and       |
|             | Public Health, CU Anschutz; Senior Editor, Research Integrity, Cochrane                  |
| 11:30-12:00 | Panel 2 Discussion   |
|             |  |
| 12:00-12:45 | Lunch  |
| 12:45-1:45  | Panel 3: The Research Institutions – Regulatory Responsibilities and Opportunities       |
|             | Moderator: Emily A. Largent, JD, PhD, RN   |
|             | Chief, Division of Medical Ethics, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy,       |
|             | University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine                                   |
|             |  |
|             | Sheila R. Garrity, JD, MPH, MBA – Preserving the Integrity of Public Health Service-     |
|             | Funded Research for Future Generations   |
|             | Director, Office of Research Integrity, Office of the Assistant Secretary for Health, US |
|             | Department of Health and Human Services  |
|             |  |
|             | Andrew Paskevich - Institutional Challenges in Navigating Research Misconduct            |
|             | Director of Academic and Research Integrity, Penn Medicine                               |
| L           | 1  |

| Mark Barnes, ID – Defamation Claims Arising from Research Misconduct Cases: Best Practices for Institutions Partner, Ropes & Gray and former Associate Provost for Research, Harvard University; Faculty Co-Director, Multi-Regional Clinical Trials Center  Barbara E. Bierer, MD – Managing Multi-Institutional Jurisdiction in Cases of Research Misconduct and Research Integrity Professor of Medicine, Harvard Medical School; Faculty Director, Multi-Regional Clinical Trials Center of Brigham and Women's Hospital and Harvard  1:45-2:15 Panel 3 Discussion Panel 4: The Path Forward – Meeting Institutional Obligations for Research Integrity Moderator: Holly Fernandez Lynch, JD, MBE Associate Professor of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine Garret FitzGerald, MD, FRS - Segregate Assessment of Biomedical Data Validity from Fraud Director, Institute for Translational Medicine and Therapeutics, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  Matthew Schrag, MD, PhD – Independent Investigation of Academic Research Misconduct Assistant Professor of Neurology, Vanderbilt University Medical Center  Nan Oransky, MD – Why Universities Should Make Misconduct Reports Public Co-founder, Retraction Watch; Distinguished Journalist in Residence, New York University's Arthur Carter Journalism Institute; Editor in Chief, The Transmitter  C.K. Gunsalus, JD – How institutions can hold themselves accountable through practical tools and knowledge Director of the National Center for Principled Leadership and Research Ethics, University of Illinois Urbana Champaign  3:30-4:00 Panel 4 Discussion Reflections on Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA Executive Director, The Good Science Project  Concluding Remarks Steven Joffs, MD, MPH Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine |           | T  |
|--|-----------|--|
| Misconduct and Research Integrity Professor of Medicine, Harvard Medical School; Faculty Director, Multi-Regional Clinical Trials Center of Brigham and Women's Hospital and Harvard  1:45-2:15 Panel 3 Discussion 2:15-2:30 Break 2:30-3:30 Panel 4: The Path Forward – Meeting Institutional Obligations for Research Integrity Moderator: Holly Fernandez Lynch, JD, MBE Associate Professor of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  Garret FitzGerald, MD, FRS - Segregate Assessment of Biomedical Data Validity from Fraud Director, Institute for Translational Medicine and Therapeutics, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  Matthew Schrag, MD, PhD – Independent Investigation of Academic Research Misconduct Assistant Professor of Neurology, Vanderbilt University Medical Center  Ivan Oransky, MD – Why Universities Should Make Misconduct Reports Public Co-founder, Retraction Watch; Distinguished Journalist in Residence, New York University's Arthur Carter Journalism Institute; Editor in Chief, The Transmitter  C.K. Gunsalus, JD – How institutions can hold themselves accountable through practical tools and knowledge Director of the National Center for Principled Leadership and Research Ethics, University of Illinois Urbana Champaign  3:30-4:00 Panel 4 Discussion  Reflections on Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA Executive Director, The Good Science Project  Concluding Remarks Steven Joffe, MD, MPH Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  |           | Practices for Institutions Partner, Ropes & Gray and former Associate Provost for Research, Harvard  |
| Clinical Trials Center of Brigham and Women's Hospital and Harvard  Panel 3 Discussion  2:15-2:30  Break  Panel 4: The Path Forward – Meeting Institutional Obligations for Research Integrity  Moderator: Holly Fernandez Lynch, JD, MBE  Associate Professor of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  Garret FitzGerald, MD, FRS - Segregate Assessment of Biomedical Data Validity from Fraud Director, Institute for Translational Medicine and Therapeutics, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  Matthew Schrag, MD, PhD – Independent Investigation of Academic Research  Misconduct Assistant Professor of Neurology, Vanderbilt University Medical Center  Ivan Oransky, MD – Why Universities Should Make Misconduct Reports Public Co-founder, Retraction Watch; Distinguished Journalist in Residence, New York University's Arthur Carter Journalism Institute; Editor in Chief, The Transmitter  C.K. Gunsalus, JD – How institutions can hold themselves accountable through practical tools and knowledge Director of the National Center for Principled Leadership and Research Ethics, University of Illinois Urbana Champaign  3:30-4:00 Panel 4 Discussion  4:00-4:30 Reflections on Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA Executive Director, The Good Science Project  Concluding Remarks Steven Joffe, MD, MPH Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  |           | Misconduct and Research Integrity  |
| 1:45-2:15 2:15-2:30 2:15-2:30 2:30-3:30 Panel 3 Discussion Panel 4: The Path Forward – Meeting Institutional Obligations for Research Integrity Moderator: Holly Fernandez Lynch, JD, MBE Associate Professor of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  Garret FitzGerald, MD, FRS - Segregate Assessment of Biomedical Data Validity from Fraud Director, Institute for Translational Medicine and Therapeutics, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  Matthew Schrag, MD, PhD – Independent Investigation of Academic Research Misconduct Assistant Professor of Neurology, Vanderbilt University Medical Center  Ivan Oransky, MD – Why Universities Should Make Misconduct Reports Public Co-founder, Retraction Watch; Distinguished Journalist in Residence, New York University's Arthur Carter Journalism Institute; Editor in Chief, The Transmitter  C.K. Gunsalus, JD – How institutions can hold themselves accountable through practical tools and knowledge Director of the National Center for Principled Leadership and Research Ethics, University of Illinois Urbana Champaign  3:30-4:00 Panel 4 Discussion Reflections on Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA Executive Director, The Good Science Project  Concluding Remarks Steven Joffe, MD, MPH Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine   |           |  |
| 2:30-3:30  Panel 4: The Path Forward – Meeting Institutional Obligations for Research Integrity Moderator: Holly Fernandez Lynch, JD, MBE Associate Professor of Medicial Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  Garret FitzGerald, MD, FRS - Segregate Assessment of Biomedical Data Validity from Fraud Director, Institute for Translational Medicine and Therapeutics, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  Matthew Schrag, MD, PhD – Independent Investigation of Academic Research Misconduct Assistant Professor of Neurology, Vanderbilt University Medical Center  Ivan Oransky, MD – Why Universities Should Make Misconduct Reports Public Co-founder, Retraction Watch; Distinguished Journalist in Residence, New York University's Arthur Carter Journalism Institute; Editor in Chief, The Transmitter  C.K. Gunsalus, JD – How institutions can hold themselves accountable through practical tools and knowledge Director of the National Center for Principled Leadership and Research Ethics, University of Illinois Urbana Champaign  3:30-4:00 Panel 4 Discussion  Reflections on Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA Executive Director, The Good Science Project  Concluding Remarks Steven Joffe, MD, MPH Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine   | 1:45-2:15 |  |
| 2:30-3:30  Panel 4: The Path Forward – Meeting Institutional Obligations for Research Integrity Moderator: Holly Fernandez Lynch, JD, MBE Associate Professor of Medicial Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  Garret FitzGerald, MD, FRS - Segregate Assessment of Biomedical Data Validity from Fraud Director, Institute for Translational Medicine and Therapeutics, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  Matthew Schrag, MD, PhD – Independent Investigation of Academic Research Misconduct Assistant Professor of Neurology, Vanderbilt University Medical Center  Ivan Oransky, MD – Why Universities Should Make Misconduct Reports Public Co-founder, Retraction Watch; Distinguished Journalist in Residence, New York University's Arthur Carter Journalism Institute; Editor in Chief, The Transmitter  C.K. Gunsalus, JD – How institutions can hold themselves accountable through practical tools and knowledge Director of the National Center for Principled Leadership and Research Ethics, University of Illinois Urbana Champaign  3:30-4:00 Panel 4 Discussion  Reflections on Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA Executive Director, The Good Science Project  Concluding Remarks Steven Joffe, MD, MPH Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine   | 2:15-2:30 | Break  |
| Fraud Director, Institute for Translational Medicine and Therapeutics, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  Matthew Schrag, MD, PhD – Independent Investigation of Academic Research Misconduct Assistant Professor of Neurology, Vanderbilt University Medical Center  Ivan Oransky, MD – Why Universities Should Make Misconduct Reports Public Co-founder, Retraction Watch; Distinguished Journalist in Residence, New York University's Arthur Carter Journalism Institute; Editor in Chief, The Transmitter  C.K. Gunsalus, JD – How institutions can hold themselves accountable through practical tools and knowledge Director of the National Center for Principled Leadership and Research Ethics, University of Illinois Urbana Champaign  3:30-4:00 Panel 4 Discussion  4:00-4:30 Reflections on Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA Executive Director, The Good Science Project  Concluding Remarks Steven Joffe, MD, MPH Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  |           | Panel 4: The Path Forward – Meeting Institutional Obligations for Research Integrity  Moderator: Holly Fernandez Lynch, JD, MBE  Associate Professor of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania |
| Misconduct Assistant Professor of Neurology, Vanderbilt University Medical Center  Ivan Oransky, MD – Why Universities Should Make Misconduct Reports Public Co-founder, Retraction Watch; Distinguished Journalist in Residence, New York University's Arthur Carter Journalism Institute; Editor in Chief, The Transmitter  C.K. Gunsalus, JD – How institutions can hold themselves accountable through practical tools and knowledge Director of the National Center for Principled Leadership and Research Ethics, University of Illinois Urbana Champaign  3:30-4:00 Panel 4 Discussion  Reflections on Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA Executive Director, The Good Science Project  Concluding Remarks Steven Joffe, MD, MPH Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  |           | Fraud Director, Institute for Translational Medicine and Therapeutics, University of   |
| Co-founder, Retraction Watch; Distinguished Journalist in Residence, New York University's Arthur Carter Journalism Institute; Editor in Chief, The Transmitter  C.K. Gunsalus, JD – How institutions can hold themselves accountable through practical tools and knowledge Director of the National Center for Principled Leadership and Research Ethics, University of Illinois Urbana Champaign  3:30-4:00 Panel 4 Discussion  Reflections on Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA Executive Director, The Good Science Project  Concluding Remarks Steven Joffe, MD, MPH Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine   |           | Misconduct   |
| tools and knowledge Director of the National Center for Principled Leadership and Research Ethics, University of Illinois Urbana Champaign  3:30-4:00 Panel 4 Discussion  4:00-4:30 Reflections on Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA Executive Director, The Good Science Project  4:30-4:45 Concluding Remarks Steven Joffe, MD, MPH Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine   |           | Co-founder, Retraction Watch; Distinguished Journalist in Residence, New York  |
| 3:30-4:00  Panel 4 Discussion  Reflections on Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity  Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA  Executive Director, The Good Science Project  Concluding Remarks  Steven Joffe, MD, MPH  Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  |           | tools and knowledge Director of the National Center for Principled Leadership and Research Ethics,   |
| Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA Executive Director, The Good Science Project  4:30-4:45  Concluding Remarks Steven Joffe, MD, MPH Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine   | 3:30-4:00 |  |
| 4:30-4:45  Concluding Remarks  Steven Joffe, MD, MPH  Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine  |           | Stuart Buck, PhD, JD, MA   |
| 4:45 Adjourn   | 4:30-4:45 | Concluding Remarks Steven Joffe, MD, MPH Chair, Department of Medical Ethics and Health Policy, University of Pennsylvania   |
|  | 4:45      | Adjourn  |